House Engrossed Senate Bill

judicial retention elections

State of Arizona Senate Fifty-sixth Legislature Second Regular Session 2024

SENATE CONCURRENT RESOLUTION 1044

A CONCURRENT RESOLUTION

PROPOSING AN AMENDMENT TO THE CONSTITUTION OF ARIZONA; AMENDING ARTICLE VI, SECTIONS 4, 9, 12, 37, 38, 39, 41 AND 42, CONSTITUTION OF ARIZONA; RELATING TO THE JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

(TEXT OF BILL BEGINS ON NEXT PAGE)

1 Be it resolved by the Senate of the State of Arizona, the House of 2 Representatives concurring: 3 1. Article VI, section 4, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 4 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 5 Governor: 6 4. <u>Supreme court; term of office</u> 7 Section 4. Justices of the supreme court shall hold 8 office for a regular term of six years DURING GOOD BEHAVIOR, 9 except as provided by AS DETERMINED EXCLUSIVELY THROUGH THE PROVISIONS OF this article AND ARTICLES VI.I AND VIII. 10 11 2. Article VI, section 9, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 12 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 13 Governor: 14 Intermediate appellate courts 9. 9. The jurisdiction, powers, 15 Section duties and 16 composition of any intermediate appellate court shall be as 17 provided by law. JUDGES OF INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURTS 18 SHALL HOLD OFFICE DURING GOOD BEHAVIOR. AS DETERMINED 19 EXCLUSIVELY THROUGH THE PROVISIONS OF THIS ARTICLE AND 20 ARTICLES VI.I AND VIII. 21 3. Article VI, section 12, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 22 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 23 Governor: 24 12. <u>Superior court; term of office</u> 25 Section 12. A. Judges of the superior court in 26 counties having a population of less than two hundred fifty 27 thousand persons according to the most recent United States census shall be elected by the qualified electors of their 28 29 counties at the general election. They shall hold office for a regular term of four years except as provided by this 30 section from and after the first Monday in January next 31 succeeding their election, and until their successors are 32 elected and qualify. The names of all candidates for judge of 33 the superior court in such counties shall be placed on the 34 35 regular ballot without partisan or other designation except 36 the division and title of the office. 37 B. The governor shall fill any vacancy in such counties by appointing a person to serve until the election and 38 39 qualification of a successor. At the next succeeding general 40 election following the appointment of a person to fill a 41 vacancy, a judge shall be elected to serve for the remainder 42 of the unexpired term. 43 Judges of the superior court in counties having a population of two hundred fifty thousand persons or more 44 45 according to the most recent United States census shall hold

office for a regular term of four years DURING GOOD BEHAVIOR, except as provided by AS DETERMINED EXCLUSIVELY THROUGH THE PROVISIONS OF this article AND ARTICLES VI.I AND VIII.

4 4. Article VI, section 37, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 5 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 6 Governor:

7 8

9

10 11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

1

2

3

37. <u>Judicial vacancies and appointments; residence;</u> <u>age</u>

Section 37. A. Within sixty days from the occurrence of a vacancy in the office of a justice or judge of any court of record, except for vacancies occurring in the office of a judge of the superior court or a judge of a court of record inferior to the superior court, the commission on appellate court appointments, if the vacancy is in the supreme court or an intermediate appellate court of record, shall submit to the governor the names of not less than three persons nominated by it to fill such vacancy, no NOT more than two of whom shall be members of the same political party unless there are more than four such nominees, in which event not more than sixty percentum PERCENT of such nominees shall be members of the same political party.

22 B. Within sixty days from the occurrence of a vacancy in the office of a judge of the superior court or a judge of a 23 24 court of record inferior to the superior court except for vacancies occurring in the office of a judge of the superior 25 26 court or a judge of a court of record inferior to the superior 27 court in a county having a population of less than two hundred fifty thousand persons according to the most recent United 28 29 States census, the commission on trial court appointments for the county in which the vacancy occurs shall submit to the 30 31 governor the names of not less than three persons nominated by it to fill such vacancy, no NOT more than two of whom shall be 32 33 members of the same political party unless there are more than four such nominees, in which event no NOT more than sixty per 34 35 centum PERCENT of such nominees shall be members of the same 36 political party. A nominee shall be under sixty-five years of age at the time **his** THE NOMINEE'S name is submitted to the 37 governor. Judges of the superior court shall be subject to 38 39 retention or rejection by a vote of the qualified electors of 40 the county from which they were appointed at the general 41 election UNDER THE CONDITIONS AND in the manner provided by section 38 of this article. 42

1 C. A vacancy in the office of a justice or a judge of such courts of record shall be filled by appointment by the 2 3 governor without regard to political affiliation from one of 4 the nominees whose names shall be ARE submitted to him THE 5 GOVERNOR as hereinabove provided. In making the appointment, the governor shall consider the diversity of the state's 6 7 population for an appellate court appointment and the 8 diversity of the county's population for a trial court 9 appointment, however the primary consideration shall be 10 merit. If the governor does not appoint one of such nominees 11 to fill such vacancy within sixty days after their names are 12 submitted to the governor by such commission, the chief 13 justice of the supreme court forthwith shall appoint on the 14 basis of merit alone without regard to political affiliation 15 one of such nominees to fill such vacancy. If such commission 16 does not, within sixty days after such vacancy occurs, submit 17 the names of nominees as hereinabove provided, the governor 18 shall have the power to appoint any qualified person to fill 19 such vacancy at any time thereafter prior to the time the 20 names of the nominees to fill such vacancy are submitted to 21 the governor as hereinabove provided. Each justice or judge so appointed shall initially hold office for a term ending 22 23 sixty days following the next regular general election after 24 the expiration of a term of two years in office. Thereafter, 25 the terms of justices or judges of the supreme court and the 26 superior court shall be as provided by this article. 27 D. A person appointed to fill a vacancy on an

intermediate appellate court or another court of record now 28 29 existing or hereafter established by law shall have been a 30 resident of the counties or county in which that vacancy 31 exists for at least one year prior to his BEFORE THE PERSON'S 32 appointment, in addition to possessing the other required qualifications. A nominee shall be under sixty-five years of 33 34 age at the time **his** THE NOMINEE'S name is submitted to the 35 governor.

36 5. Article VI, section 38, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 37 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 38 Governor:

39 40 41

38. <u>Declaration of candidacy; form of judicial</u> <u>ballot, rejection and retention; failure to</u> <u>file declaration</u>

42 Section 38. A. A ANY justice or judge of the supreme 43 court or an intermediate appellate court shall file in the 44 office of the secretary of state, and a ANY judge of the 45 superior court or other court of record including such

1 justices or judges who are holding office as such by election or appointment at the time of the adoption of this section OR 2 3 ANY AMENDMENT TO THIS SECTION except for judges of the 4 superior court and other courts of record inferior to the 5 superior court in counties having a population of less than 6 two hundred fifty thousand persons, according to the United 7 States census, shall BE SUBJECT TO A VOTE OF RETENTION ON THE 8 OCCURRENCE OF ANY OF THE FOLLOWING: 9 1. A FINAL CONVICTION OF A FELONY OFFENSE IF NOT 10 OTHERWISE REMOVED PURSUANT TO ARTICLE VI.I, SECTION 3. 11 2. A FINAL CONVICTION OF ANY CRIME INVOLVING FRAUD OR 12 DISHONESTY IF NOT OTHERWISE REMOVED PURSUANT TO ARTICLE VI.I, 13 SECTION 3. 14 3. AN INITIATION OF PERSONAL BANKRUPTCY PROCEEDINGS IN 15 WHICH THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE IS A DEBTOR. 16 4. A FORECLOSURE OF ANY MORTGAGE FOR WHICH THE JUSTICE 17 OR JUDGE IS A MORTGAGOR. 18 5. A DETERMINATION PURSUANT TO SECTION 42 OF THIS 19 ARTICLE, BY A MAJORITY OF ALL MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION ON 20 JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE REVIEW, THAT THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE DOES 21 NOT MEET JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE STANDARDS. 22 B. A JUSTICE OR JUDGE OF THE SUPREME COURT OR AN 23 INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT WHO IS SUBJECT TO A VOTE OF RETENTION PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION A OF THIS SECTION SHALL FILE 24 25 IN THE OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY OF STATE, AND A JUDGE OF THE 26 SUPERIOR COURT WHO IS SUBJECT TO A VOTE OF RETENTION PURSUANT 27 TO SUBSECTION A OF THIS SECTION SHALL file in the office of the clerk of the board of supervisors of the county in which 28 29 the THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE regularly sits and resides, not less 30 than sixty nor more than ninety days prior to BEFORE the 31 regular general election next preceding the expiration of his 32 term of office SUBSEQUENT TO THE EVENT REQUIRING A VOTE OF RETENTION, a declaration of his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S 33 34 desire to be retained in office, and the secretary of state 35 shall certify to the several boards of supervisors the 36 appropriate names of the candidate or candidates appearing on 37 such declarations filed in his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S office, EXCEPT THAT IF THE EVENT REQUIRING A VOTE OF RETENTION 38 39 OCCURS LESS THAN ONE HUNDRED TWENTY DAYS BEFORE A REGULAR 40 GENERAL ELECTION, THE DECLARATION SHALL BE FILED NOT LESS THAN 41 SIXTY NOR MORE THAN NINETY DAYS BEFORE THE NEXT ENSUING REGULAR GENERAL ELECTION. NOT LATER THAN ONE HUNDRED TWENTY 42 43 DAYS BEFORE A REGULAR GENERAL ELECTION, THE CHIEF JUSTICE OF THE SUPREME COURT SHALL PROVIDE TO THE SECRETARY OF STATE A 44 45 LIST OF ALL JUSTICES OR JUDGES WHO ARE SUBJECT TO A VOTE OF

5

6

8

9

10 11

12

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1 RETENTION AT SUCH ELECTION PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION A OF THIS 2 SECTION. THE DETERMINATION OF WHETHER A JUSTICE OR JUDGE IS 3 SUBJECT TO RETENTION SHALL BE MADE BY THE CHIEF JUSTICE OF THE 4 SUPREME COURT, EXCEPT THAT, WITH RESPECT TO ANY EVENT REQUIRING A VOTE OF RETENTION INVOLVING THE CHIEF JUSTICE OF THE SUPREME COURT, THE DETERMINATION SHALL BE MADE BY THE VICE 7 CHIEF JUSTICE OF THE SUPREME COURT.

B. C. The name of any justice or judge whose declaration is filed as provided in this section shall be placed on the appropriate official ballot at the next regular general election under a nonpartisan designation and in substantially the following form:

13 Shall _____, (Name of justice or judge) of the 14 _ court be retained in office? Yes __ No __ (Mark X 15 after one).

C. D. If a majority of those voting on the question votes "No," then, upon the expiration of the term for which such justice or judge was serving ON JANUARY 1 OF THE YEAR FOLLOWING THE GENERAL ELECTION, a vacancy shall exist, which shall be filled as provided by this article. If a majority of those voting on the question votes "Yes," such justice or judge shall remain in office for another term, subject to removal as provided by this constitution.

24 D. E. The votes shall be counted and canvassed and the 25 result declared as in the case of state and county elections, 26 whereupon a certificate of retention or rejection of the 27 incumbent justice or judge shall be delivered to him THE 28 **INCUMBENT** by the secretary of state or the clerk of the board 29 of supervisors, as the case may be.

E. F. If a justice or JUDGE WHO IS SUBJECT TO 30 31 RETENTION PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION A OF THIS SECTION fails to file a declaration of his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S desire to 32 33 be retained in office. as required by this section SUBSECTION B OF THIS SECTION, then his THE JUSTICE'S OR 34 35 JUDGE'S office shall become vacant upon expiration of the term 36 for which such justice or judge was serving ON JANUARY 1 OF THE YEAR FOLLOWING THE GENERAL ELECTION IN WHICH THE JUSTICE 37 OR JUDGE WOULD HAVE BEEN A CANDIDATE FOR RETENTION. 38

39 G. ANY JUDGE OF AN INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURT WHO IS 40 SUBJECT TO A VOTE OF RETENTION PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION A OF 41 THIS SECTION SHALL BE ELECTED FOR RETENTION ON A STATEWIDE BASIS AND ALL OTHERWISE ELIGIBLE REGISTERED VOTERS IN THIS 42 43 STATE ARE ELIGIBLE TO VOTE ON SUCH RETENTION ELECTIONS.

1 6. Article VI, section 39, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 2 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 3 Governor:

4 39. <u>Retirement of justices and judges; vacancies</u> 5 Section 39. A. On attaining the age of seventy years a 6 justice or judge of a court of record shall retire and his THE 7 JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S judicial office shall be vacant, except 8 as otherwise provided in section 35 of this article. Τn 9 addition to becoming vacant as provided in this section, the office of a justice or judge of any court of record becomes 10 11 vacant upon his ON THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S death or his THE 12 JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S voluntary retirement pursuant to statute 13 or his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S voluntary resignation, and also, IF SUBJECT TO A VOTE OF RETENTION as provided in section 14 38 of this article, upon the expiration of his term ON JANUARY 15 16 1 OF THE YEAR next following a general election at which a 17 majority of those voting on the question of his THE JUSTICE'S 18 OR JUDGE'S retention vote in the negative or for which general 19 election he THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE is required, but fails, to 20 file a declaration of his THE JUSTICE'S OR JUDGE'S desire to 21 be retained in office. 22

B. This section is alternative to and cumulative with the methods of removal of judges and justices provided in ARTICLE VI.I AND ARTICLE VIII, parts 1 and 2 of article 8 and article 6.1 of this Constitution.

7. Article VI, section 41, Constitution of Arizona, is
proposed to be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on
proclamation of the Governor:

29 30

31

32

33

34 35

36 37

23 24

25

41. <u>Superior court divisions; commission on trial</u> <u>court appointments; membership; terms</u>

Section 41. A. Except as otherwise provided, judges of the superior court in counties having a population of two hundred fifty thousand persons or more according to the most recent United States census shall hold office for a regular term of four years DURING GOOD BEHAVIOR, AS DETERMINED EXCLUSIVELY THROUGH THE PROVISIONS OF THIS ARTICLE AND ARTICLES VI.I AND VIII.

B. There shall be a nonpartisan commission on trial court appointments for each county having a population of two hundred fifty thousand persons or more according to the most recent United States census which shall be composed of the following members:

43 1. The chief justice of the supreme court, who shall be44 the chairman of the commission. In the event of the absence

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

or incapacity of the chairman the supreme court shall appoint a justice thereof to serve in his place and stead.

2. Five attorney members, none of whom shall reside in the same supervisorial district and not more than three of whom shall be members of the same political party, who are nominated by the board of governors of the state bar of Arizona and who are appointed by the governor subject to confirmation by the senate in the manner prescribed by law.

3. Ten nonattorney members, no more than two of whom shall reside in the same supervisorial district.

11 C. At least ninety days prior to BEFORE a term expiring 12 or within twenty-one days of a vacancy occurring for a 13 nonattorney member on the commission for trial court appointments, the member of the board of supervisors from the 14 district in which the vacancy has occurred shall appoint a 15 16 nominating committee of seven members who reside in the 17 district, not more than four of whom may be from the same 18 political party. The make-up MAKEUP of the committee shall, 19 to the extent feasible, SHALL reflect the diversity of the 20 population of the district. Members shall not be attorneys 21 and shall not hold any governmental office, elective or 22 appointive, for profit. The committee shall provide public notice that a vacancy exists and shall solicit, review and 23 24 forward to the governor all applications along with the 25 committee's recommendations for appointment. The governor 26 shall appoint two persons from each supervisorial district who 27 shall not be of the same political party, subject to confirmation by the senate in the manner prescribed by law. 28

29 D. In making or confirming appointments to trial court 30 commissions, the governor, the senate and the state bar shall 31 endeavor to see that the commission reflects the diversity of 32 the county's population.

E. Members of the commission shall serve staggered four year terms, except that initial appointments for the five additional nonattorney members and the two additional attorney members of the commission shall be designated by the governor as follows:

One appointment for a nonattorney member shall be
 for a one-year term.
 Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be

402. Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be41for a two-year term.

42 3. Two appointments for nonattorney members shall be 43 for a three-year term.

44 4. One appointment for an attorney member shall be for 45 a one-year term.

5. One appointment for an attorney member shall be for a two-year term.

2 3 4

1

F. Vacancies shall be filled for the unexpired terms in the same manner as the original appointments.

5 6

8

9

11

12

13

14

17

19

20 21

22

23

24

G. Attorney members of the commission shall have resided in this state and shall have been admitted to practice 7 in this state by the supreme court for at least five years and shall have resided in the supervisorial district from which they are appointed for at least one year. Nonattorney members 10 shall have resided in this state for at least five years. shall have resided in the supervisorial district for at least one year before being nominated and shall not be judges, retired judges nor admitted to practice before the supreme court. None of the attorney or nonattorney members of the commission shall hold any governmental office, elective or 15 16 appointive, for profit and no attorney member is eligible for appointment to any judicial office of this state until one 18 year after membership in the commission terminates.

H. No person other than the chief justice shall serve at the same time as a member of more than one judicial appointment commission.

I. The commission shall submit the names of not less than three individuals for nomination for the office of the superior court judge pursuant to section 37 of this article.

25 J. Prior to BEFORE making recommendations to the 26 governor, the commission shall conduct investigations, hold 27 public hearings and take public testimony. An executive session as prescribed by rule may be held upon a two-thirds 28 29 vote of the members of the commission in a public hearing. 30 Final decisions as to recommendations shall be made without 31 regard to political affiliation in an impartial and objective manner. The commission shall consider the diversity of the 32 county's population and the geographical distribution of the 33 residences of the judges throughout the county, however the 34 35 primary consideration shall be merit. Voting shall be in a 36 public hearing. The expenses of meetings of the commission 37 and the attendance of members thereof for travel and subsistence shall be paid from the general fund of the state 38 39 as state officers are paid, upon claims approved by the 40 chairman.

41 K. After public hearings the supreme court shall adopt 42 rules of procedure for the commission on trial court 43 appointments.

1 The members of the commission who were appointed t. 2 pursuant to section 36 of this article prior to the effective 3 date of this section may continue to serve until the 4 expiration of their normal terms. All subsequent appointments 5 shall be made as prescribed by this section. 6 8. Article VI, section 42, Constitution of Arizona, is proposed to 7 be amended as follows if approved by the voters and on proclamation of the 8 Governor: 9 42. Retention evaluation of justices and judges 10 Section 42. A. The supreme court shall adopt, after 11 public hearings, and administer for all justices and JUDGES OF 12 THE INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURTS AND judges who file a 13 declaration to be retained in office, OF THE SUPERIOR COURT IN A COUNTY WITH A POPULATION OF TWO HUNDRED FIFTY THOUSAND 14 15 PERSONS OR MORE ACCORDING TO THE MOST RECENT UNITED STATES 16 CENSUS OR IN A COUNTY WITH A POPULATION OF LESS THAN TWO 17 HUNDRED FIFTY THOUSAND PERSONS ACCORDING TO THE MOST RECENT 18 UNITED STATES CENSUS THAT CHOOSES TO SELECT ITS JUDGES OF THE 19 SUPERIOR COURT AS IF IT HAD A POPULATION OF TWO HUNDRED FIFTY 20 THOUSAND PERSONS OR MORE a COMMISSION AND process, established 21 by court rules for evaluating judicial performance. The rules 22 shall PROVIDE THAT EACH JUSTICE OR JUDGE SHALL BE EVALUATED 23 NOT LESS FREQUENTLY THAN EVERY FOUR YEARS FROM THE YEAR OF 24 FIRST APPOINTMENT, AND SHALL include written performance 25 standards and performance reviews which survey opinions of 26 persons who have knowledge of the justice's or judge's 27 performance. B. A MAJORITY OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES SHALL 28 29 APPOINT ONE MEMBER TO THE COMMISSION AND A MAJORITY OF THE 30 SENATE SHALL APPOINT ONE MEMBER TO THE COMMISSION. THE HOUSE 31 OF REPRESENTATIVES AND SENATE HAVE COMPLETE DISCRETION IN 32 APPOINTING MEMBERS PURSUANT TO THIS SECTION, AND SUCH MEMBERS SHALL HAVE RIGHTS AND PRIVILEGES EQUAL TO ALL OTHER MEMBERS OF 33 34 THE COMMISSION. 35 C. UPON WRITTEN REQUEST OF A LEGISLATOR, THE COMMISSION 36 SHALL INVESTIGATE AN ALLEGATION THAT A JUSTICE OR JUDGE HAS 37 ENGAGED IN A PATTERN OF MALFEASANCE IN OFFICE. IF THE COMMISSION FINDS THAT THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE HAS ENGAGED IN A 38 39 PATTERN OF MALFEASANCE IN OFFICE, THE COMMISSION SHALL MAKE A 40 DETERMINATION THAT THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE DOES NOT MEET JUDICIAL 41 PERFORMANCE STANDARDS. D. The public shall be afforded a full and fair 42 43 opportunity for participation in the evaluation process through public hearings, dissemination of evaluation reports 44 45 to voters and any other methods as the court deems advisable.

1	Sec. 9. <u>Effective date</u>
2	If approved by a majority of the votes cast thereon,
3	this act applies retroactively to from and after October 31,
4	2024, and the returns of any votes of retention or rejection
5	in the general election held on November 5, 2024 shall not be
6	included in the official canvass or result in the issuance of
7	any certificate of retention or rejection.
8	Sec. 10. <u>Findings</u>
9	The People of the State of Arizona find and declare as
10	follows:
11	1. Judicial retention elections in the State of Arizona
12	are simultaneously too infrequent, because judges whose
13	conduct proves unsuitable for judicial office may serve for
14	years before next standing for retention; and too frequent,
15	because judges whose conduct is objectively satisfactory stand
16	for retention regardless of their good behavior and
17	performance.
18	2. The voters of the State of Arizona have exercised
19	the right not to retain a judge in 0.3% of judicial retention
20	elections to date, indicating both general satisfaction with
21	judicial performance in the state and an ongoing public
22	interest in electoral accountability for the judicial branch.
23	3. The number of judicial retention elections appearing
24	on the ballot unduly increases the financial cost of
25	elections, the length and complexity of ballots, and the
26	complexity and duration of vote tabulation.
27	4. The voters of the State of Arizona will be able to
28	research judicial performance more efficiently, and persons
29	who are not well suited for judicial office will be unable to
30	"hide in a crowd" of peers, when retention elections feature
31	only judicial officers whose conduct falls below objective
32	standards.
33	5. It is appropriate to amend the process of judicial
34	retention elections to ensure accountability for the judicial
35	officers of this State and to increase the efficiency of our
36	elections.
37	Sec. 11. <u>Short title</u>
38	This act shall be titled the "Judicial Accountability
39	Act of 2024."
40	12. The Secretary of State shall submit this proposition to the
41	voters at the next general election as provided by article XXI,
42	Constitution of Arizona.

PASSED BY THE HOUSE JUNE 12, 2024.

PASSED BY THE SENATE MARCH 6, 2024.

FILED IN THE OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY OF STATE JUNE 13, 2024.