REFERENCE TITLE: open meetings; public body; legislature

State of Arizona House of Representatives Fifty-sixth Legislature Second Regular Session 2024

## **HB 2481**

Introduced by Representative Parker B

### AN ACT

AMENDING SECTIONS 38-431, 38-431.01, 38-431.02 AND 38-431.08, ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES; RELATING TO PUBLIC MEETINGS AND PROCEEDINGS.

(TEXT OF BILL BEGINS ON NEXT PAGE)

- i -

 Be it enacted by the Legislature of the State of Arizona: Section 1. Section 38-431, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to read:

### 38-431. <u>Definitions</u>

In this article, unless the context otherwise requires:

- 1. "Advisory committee" or "subcommittee" means any entity, however designated, that is officially established, on motion and order of a public body or by the presiding officer of the public body, and whose members have been appointed for the specific purpose of making a recommendation concerning a decision to be made or considered or a course of conduct to be taken or considered by the public body.
- 2. "Executive session" means a gathering of a quorum of members of a public body from which the public is excluded for one or more of the reasons prescribed in section 38-431.03. In addition to the members of the public body, officers, appointees and employees as provided in section 38-431.03 and the auditor general as provided in section 41-1279.04, only individuals whose presence is reasonably necessary in order for the public body to carry out its executive session responsibilities may attend the executive session.
- 3. "Legal action" means a collective decision, commitment or promise made by a public body pursuant to the constitution, the public body's charter, bylaws or specified scope of appointment and the laws of this state.
  - 4. "Meeting":
- (a) Means the gathering, in person or through technological devices, of a quorum of the members of a public body at which they discuss, propose or take legal action, including any deliberations by a quorum with respect to that action.
  - (b) Includes:
- (i) A one-way electronic communication by one member of a public body that is sent to a quorum of the members of a public body and that proposes legal action.
- (ii) An exchange of electronic communications among a quorum of the members of a public body that involves a discussion, deliberation or the taking of legal action by the public body concerning a matter likely to come before the public body for action.
- 5. "Political subdivision" means all political subdivisions of this state, including without limitation all counties, cities and towns, school districts and special districts.
- 6. "Public body" means the legislature, all boards and commissions of this state or political subdivisions, all multimember governing bodies of departments, agencies, institutions and instrumentalities of this state or political subdivisions, including without limitation all corporations and other instrumentalities whose boards of directors are appointed or elected by this state or a political subdivision. Public body includes

- 1 -

all quasi-judicial bodies and all standing, special or advisory committees or subcommittees of, or appointed by, the public body. Public body includes all commissions and other public entities established by the Arizona Constitution or by way of ballot initiative, including the independent redistricting commission, and this article applies except and only to the extent that specific constitutional provisions supersede this article.

- 7. "Quasi-judicial body" means a public body, other than a court of law, possessing the power to hold hearings on disputed matters between a private person and a public agency and to make decisions in the general manner of a court regarding such disputed claims.
- Sec. 2. Section 38-431.01, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to read:

# 38-431.01. Meetings shall be open to the public; seating: minutes; recordings

- A. All meetings of any public body shall be public meetings and all persons so desiring shall be allowed to attend and listen to the deliberations and proceedings. ALL PUBLIC BODIES SHALL PROVIDE AN OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IN PERSON BEFORE ANY FINAL DECISION, SUBJECT TO REASONABLE TIME, PLACE AND MANNER RESTRICTIONS. All legal action of public bodies shall occur during a public meeting.
- B. Schools, school boards, executive boards and municipalities ALL PUBLIC BODIES shall provide for an amount of seating sufficient to accommodate the reasonably anticipated attendance of all persons desiring to attend the deliberations and proceedings, when feasible. This section SUBSECTION does not require a public body to relocate a meeting outside of the largest regular meeting room.
- C. All public bodies shall provide for the taking of written minutes or a recording of all their meetings, including executive sessions. For meetings other than executive sessions, the minutes or recording shall include:
  - 1. The date, time and place of the meeting.
- 2. The members of the public body recorded as either present or absent.
  - 3. A general description of the matters considered.
- 4. An accurate description of all legal actions proposed, discussed or taken, including a record of how each member voted. The minutes shall also include the names of the members who propose each motion and the names of the persons, as given, who make statements or present material to the public body and a reference to the legal action about which they made statements or presented material.
- D. Minutes of executive sessions shall include items set forth in subsection C, paragraphs 1, 2 and 3 of this section, an accurate description of all instructions given pursuant to section 38-431.03,

- 2 -

subsection A, paragraphs 4, 5 and 7 and other matters as may be deemed appropriate by the public body.

- E. The minutes or a recording of a meeting shall be available for public inspection three working days after the meeting except as otherwise specifically provided by this article.
- F. A public body of a city or town with a population of more than two thousand five hundred persons shall:
- 1. Within three working days after a meeting, except for subcommittees and advisory committees, post on its website, if applicable, either:
- (a) A statement describing the legal actions taken by the public body of the city or town during the meeting.
  - (b) Any recording of the meeting.
- 2. Within two working days following approval of the minutes, post approved minutes of city or town council meetings on its website, if applicable, except as otherwise specifically provided by this article.
- 3. Within ten working days after a subcommittee or advisory committee meeting, post on its website, if applicable, either:
  - (a) A statement describing legal action, if any.
  - (b) A recording of the meeting.
- G. All or any part of a public meeting of a public body may be recorded by any person in attendance by means of a tape recorder or camera or any other means of sonic reproduction, provided that there is no active interference with the conduct of the meeting.
- H. The secretary of state for state public bodies, the city or town clerk for municipal public bodies and the county clerk for all other local public bodies shall conspicuously post open meeting law materials prepared and approved by the attorney general on their website. A person elected or appointed to a public body shall review the open meeting law materials at least one day before the day that person takes office.
- I. A public body may SHALL make an open call to the public during a public meeting, subject to reasonable time, place and manner restrictions, to allow individuals to address the public body on any issue within the jurisdiction of the public body. At the conclusion of an open call to the public, individual members of the public body may respond to criticism made by those who have addressed the public body, may ask staff to review a matter or may ask that a matter be put on a future agenda. However, members of the public body shall not discuss or take legal action on matters raised during an open call to the public unless the matters are properly noticed for discussion and legal action.
- J. A member of a public body shall not knowingly direct any staff member to communicate in violation of this article.
- K. Any posting required by subsection F of this section must remain on the applicable website for at least one year after the date of the posting.

- 3 -

 Sec. 3. Section 38-431.02, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to read:

#### 38-431.02. Notice of meetings

- A. Public notice of all meetings of public bodies shall be given as follows:
- 1. The public bodies of this state, including governing bodies of charter schools, shall:
- (a) Conspicuously post a statement on their website stating where all public notices of their meetings will be posted, including the physical and electronic locations, and shall give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings.
- (b) Post all public meeting notices on their website and give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings. A technological problem or failure that either prevents posting public notices on a website or that temporarily or permanently prevents using all or part of the website does not preclude holding the meeting for which the notice was posted if the public body complies with all other public notice requirements required by this section.
  - 2. The public bodies of the counties and school districts shall:
- (a) Conspicuously post a statement on their website stating where all public notices of their meetings will be posted, including the physical and electronic locations, and shall give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings.
- (b) Post all public meeting notices on their website and give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings. A technological problem or failure that either prevents posting public notices on a website or that temporarily or permanently prevents using all or part of the website does not preclude holding the meeting for which the notice was posted if the public body complies with all other public notice requirements required by this section.
  - 3. Special districts that are formed pursuant to title 48:
- (a) May conspicuously post a statement on their website stating where all public notices of their meetings will be posted, including the physical and electronic locations, and shall give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings.
- (b) May post all public meeting notices on their website and shall give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings. A technological problem or failure that either prevents posting public notices on a website or that temporarily or permanently prevents using all or part of the website does not preclude holding the meeting for which the notice was posted if the public body complies with all other public notice requirements required by this section.
- (c) If a statement or notice is not posted pursuant to subdivision (a) or (b) of this paragraph, shall file a statement with the clerk of the board of supervisors stating where all public notices of their meetings

- 4 -

will be posted and shall give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings.

- 4. The public bodies of the cities and towns shall:
- (a) Conspicuously post a statement on their website or on a website of an association of cities and towns stating where all public notices of their meetings will be posted, including the physical and electronic locations, and shall give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings.
- (b) Post all public meeting notices on their website or on a website of an association of cities and towns and give additional public notice as is reasonable and practicable as to all meetings. A technological problem or failure that either prevents posting public notices on a website or that temporarily or permanently prevents using all or part of the website does not preclude holding the meeting for which the notice was posted if the public body complies with all other public notice requirements required by this section.
- B. If an executive session is scheduled, a notice of the executive session shall state the provision of law authorizing the executive session, and the notice shall be provided to the:
  - 1. Members of the public body.
  - 2. General public.
- C. Except as provided in subsections D and E of this section, meetings shall not be held without at least twenty-four FORTY-EIGHT hours' notice to the members of the public body and to the general public. The twenty-four-hour FORTY-EIGHT-HOUR period includes Saturdays if the public has access to the physical posted location in addition to any website posting, but excludes Sundays and other holidays prescribed in section 1-301.
- D. In case of an actual emergency, a meeting, including an executive session, may be held on such notice as is appropriate to the circumstances. If this subsection is used for conduct of an emergency session or the consideration of an emergency measure at a previously scheduled meeting the public body must post a public notice within twenty-four hours declaring that an emergency session has been held and setting forth the information required in subsections H and I of this section.
- E. A meeting may be recessed and resumed with less than twenty-four FORTY-EIGHT hours' notice if public notice of the initial session of the meeting is given as required in subsection A of this section, and if, before recessing, notice is publicly given as to the time and place of the resumption of the meeting or the method by which notice shall be publicly given.
- F. A public body that intends to meet for a specified calendar period, on a regular day, date or event during the calendar period, and at a regular place and time, may post public notice of the meetings at the

- 5 -

beginning of the period. The notice shall specify the period for which notice is applicable.

- G. Notice required under this section shall include an agenda of the matters to be discussed or decided at the meeting or information on how the public may obtain a copy of such an agenda. The agenda must be available to the public at least twenty-four FORTY-EIGHT hours before the meeting, except in the case of an actual emergency under subsection D of this section. The twenty-four-hour FORTY-EIGHT-HOUR period includes Saturdays if the public has access to the physical posted location in addition to any website posting, but excludes Sundays and other holidays prescribed in section 1-301.
- H. Agendas required under this section shall list the specific matters to be discussed, considered or decided at the meeting, BE MADE PUBLICLY AVAILABLE ONLINE AND INCLUDE A HYPERLINK TO ANY RELEVANT DOCUMENTS, CONTRACTS, AGREEMENTS OR PROPOSALS UNDER CONSIDERATION BY THE PUBLIC BODY AND REFERENCED IN THE AGENDA. Except for a meeting through technological devices, the agenda shall also include notice of the time that the public will have physical access to the meeting place. The public body may discuss, consider or make decisions only on matters listed on the agenda and other matters related thereto.
- I. Notwithstanding the other provisions of this section, notice of executive sessions shall be required to include only a general description of the matters to be considered. The agenda shall provide more than just a recital of the statutory provisions authorizing the executive session, but need not contain information that would defeat the purpose of the executive session, compromise the legitimate privacy interests of a public officer, appointee or employee or compromise the attorney-client privilege.
- J. Notwithstanding subsections H and I of this section, in the case of an actual emergency a matter may be discussed and considered and, at public meetings, decided, if the matter was not listed on the agenda and a statement setting forth the reasons necessitating the discussion, consideration or decision is placed in the minutes of the meeting and is publicly announced at the public meeting. In the case of an executive session, the reason for consideration of the emergency measure shall be announced publicly immediately before the executive session.
- K. Notwithstanding subsection H of this section, the chief administrator, presiding officer or a member of a public body may present a brief summary of current events without listing in the agenda the specific matters to be summarized, if:
  - 1. The summary is listed on the agenda.
- 2. The public body does not propose, discuss, deliberate or take legal action at that meeting on any matter in the summary unless the specific matter is properly noticed for legal action.

- 6 -

Sec. 4. Section 38-431.08, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to read:

38-431.08. Exceptions; limitation

- A. This article does not apply to:
- 1. Any judicial proceeding of any court or any political caucus of the legislature.
- 2. Any conference committee of the legislature, except that all such meetings shall be open to the public.
- 3. 2. The commissions on appellate and trial court appointments and the commission on judicial qualifications.
- $\frac{4.}{3.}$  Good cause exception and central registry exception determinations and hearings conducted by the board of fingerprinting pursuant to sections 41-619.55 and 41-619.57.
- B. A hearing held within a prison facility by the board of executive clemency is subject to this article, except that the director of the state department of corrections may:
- 1. Prohibit, on written findings that are made public within five days of AFTER so finding, any person from attending a hearing whose attendance would constitute a serious threat to the life or physical safety of any person or to the safe, secure and orderly operation of the prison.
- 2. Require a person who attends a hearing to sign an attendance log. If the person is over sixteen years of age, the person shall produce photographic identification that verifies the person's signature.
- 3. Prevent and prohibit any articles from being taken into a hearing except recording devices and, if the person who attends a hearing is a member of the media, cameras.
- 4. Require that a person who attends a hearing submit to a reasonable search on entering the facility.
- C. The exclusive remedies available to any person who is denied attendance at or removed from a hearing by the director of the state department of corrections in violation of this section shall be those remedies available in section 38-431.07, as against the director only.
- D. Either house of the legislature may adopt a rule or procedure pursuant to article IV, part 2, section 8, Constitution of Arizona, to provide an exemption to the notice and agenda requirements of this article or to allow standing or conference committees to meet through technological devices rather than only in person.

- 7 -